Cloud Native Computing Foundation

Minutes of a meeting of the Governing Board

December 14, 2023

A meeting of the Governing Board of the Cloud Native Computing Foundation ("CNCF"), which is part of The Linux Foundation, was held on December 14, 2023, from 4:00-6:00 PM PT time via Zoom LFX.

The following members of the Governing Board, constituting a quorum under the CNCF Charter, were present:

Li (Mark) Yi	Alibaba Cloud
Alena Prokhachyk	Apple
Jenn Skeivik	Boeing
Justin Dustzadeh	Equinix
Takao Indoh	Fujitsu
Anne Bertucio	Google
Bill Ren Xudong	Huawei
Naresh Duddu	Infosys
Arun Gupta	Intel, Chairperson
Chris Wright	Red Hat / IBM
Stephen Chin	JFrog
Lachlan Evenson	Microsoft
Sudha Raghavan	Oracle
Clint Kitson	VMware / Broadcom
Christoph Blecker	Developer Seat
Emily Fox	TOC Chair

Also in attendance were:

Huxing Zhang	Alibaba Cloud (alternate)
Damani Corbin	Boeing (alternate)
Stephen Augustus	Cisco (alternate)
William Deniss	Google (alternate)
Ash Mazhari	Grafana (alternate)
Bryan Che	Huawei (alternate)
Jatinder Singh Purba	Infosys (alternate)
Bridget Khomhout	Microsoft (alternate)
Matt Farina	TOC
Erin Boyd	TOC
Priyanka Sharma	CNCF

Chris Aniszczyk	CNCF
Joanna Lee	CNCF
Melissa Smolensky	CNCF
Taylor Waggoner	CNCF
Paige O'Connor	CNCF
Taylor Dolezal	CNCF
Vanessa Heric	The Linux Foundation
Casey Robinson	The Linux Foundation
Clyde Seepersad	The Linux Foundation
Nirav Patel	The Linux Foundation
Robert Reeves	The Linux Foundation
Mike Dolan	The Linux Foundation

Ms. Sharma called the meeting to order at 4:02 PM PT. She welcomed the board members to the call and thanked everyone for attending. Ms. Sharma then reviewed the Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy Notice, confirmed that quorum was present, and reviewed the meeting agenda.

Ms. Sharma welcomed the new Governing Board CNCF members and alternates.

Voting Matters
Ms. Sharma gave an overview of the three resolutions that will be voted on during the meeting.

Resolution #1 - Minutes
Ms. Sharma presented the resolution to adopt the minutes of the September 14, 2023, Governing Board Meeting.
- Mr. Chin motioned to approve the resolution.
- Ms. Prokharchyk seconded.
- Mr. Dustzadeh and Mr. Kitson abstained
- All others were in favor, none opposed

RESOLVED: The minutes of September 14, 2023, meeting of the Governing Board, in the form attached hereto as Exhibit A, are hereby confirmed, approved, and adopted.

Budget Update
Ms. Sharma reviewed a summary of the 2023 forecast and planned investments. She presented where CNCF is progressing across a variety of programs and categories including scholarships, strategic programs, end user programs, operations, and project support.

Ms. Sharma reviewed the 2023 end of year reforecast. Based on membership and event sponsorships, the revenue came in higher than expected b. The training and certification revenue and event registration came in lower than expected. CNCF saved expenses across most categories with the largest deltas being in events and strategic programs.

Ms. Sharma gave an update on the 2023 investments. She shared that this year, CNCF successfully invested in upleveling our support for our technologies and communities, including areas such as, K8s infrastructure now multi-cloud running on AWS and GCP with inbound credits from Oracle Cloud, 14 security audits and formed a developer experience team providing additional support for projects and TOC. Investment in the ecosystem included a new [landscape](), 500 more scholarships than 2022, and a newly created End User Technical Advisory Board (TAB).

Ms. Sharma presented the 2024 proposed budget. She shared in detail the planned 2024 investment areas and strategic priorities - memberships and largest contributor geographies.

Ms. Sharma reviewed the 2024 expenses forecast, noting a new KubeCon + CloudNativeCon India event to cater to the burgeoning India contributor base and new members there, as well as a right-sized KubeCon China. She also reviewed anticipated additional staff headcount.

Mr. Sharma shared the 2023 Actuals will be ready for review at the March 2024 Board meeting.

Resolution #2 - Budget
Ms. Sharma presented the resolution to adopt the 2024 Budget.
- Mr. Gupta motioned to approve
- Ms. Raghavan seconded
- All in favor, none opposed

RESOLVED: The 2024 Budget, presented to the board for approval in the form attached, are hereby confirmed, approved, and adopted.

New Policy Proposal: CNCF Political Statements
Ms. Lee explained that multiple board members suggested to CNCF staff that CNCF adopt clear guidelines around CNCF's ability to make political statements or take other action on political issues.

Ms. Lee shared that she will draft a policy for the Governing Board's consideration designed to address these concerns. She encouraged the board to provide comments and feedback to the draft, which will be shared by email in January.

Ms. Lee asked if there were any questions. Mr. Chin asked whether the Linux Foundation has a policy that CNCF should follow or align its own policy with. Mr. Dolan responded that the Linux Foundation's policy is that it does not make statements of a political nature. Mr. Chin asked for clarification on whether this is a written policy or a policy in practice. Mr. Dolan confirmed it is the latter.

Ms. Lee said that we will schedule an optional meeting early in the new year for board members to discuss and provide feedback on the draft policy after it is circulated.

End User Ecosystem

Ms. Lee presented the new launch of the End User Technical Advisory Board (TAB), which will serve as the voice of end users in our ecosystem. The TAB consists of 2 platinum member seats, 2 gold member seats, 3 silver member seats, 4 at-large seats and 2 TOC-appointed seats. Ms. Lee shared several discussion items that are on the list for the Q1 2024 meeting, including, reference architectures, updating the end user definition, collaboration with TOC, developing a mechanism of End Users to provide feedback to CNCF projects, oversight of End User Groups, and Cloud Native Executive Summit and the CNCF Radar. Ms. Lee encouraged the board to reach out to herself or Mr. Dolezal if there are other matters they request that the End User TAB to consider.

Ms. Lee proposed changes to the CNCF Charter in order to facilitate collaboration and coordination between the governing board and the End User TAB. Proposed changes to modify section 5(c)(ii) inserting the new paragraph to read as, "The End User TAB shall select a Chair of the End User TAB to set agendas, facilitate discussions, and serve as the End User TAB representative to the Governing Board. The End User TAB may also, at its option, select one or two Vice Chairs."

Resolution #3 - Updated End User TAB Charter

Ms. Lee presented the resolution to approve the amendments to the CNCF Charter related to the End User Technical Advisory Board.
- Mr. Blecker motioned to approve
- Ms. Prokharchyk seconded
- All in favor, none opposed

RESOLVED: The amendments to the CNCF Charter related to the End User Technical Advisory Board, in the form attached hereto as Exhibit B, are hereby confirmed, approved, and adopted.

Mr. Dolezal shared that Spotify was recently awarded the top End User Award at KubeCon + CloudNativeCon North America 2023, in recognition of their significant contributions to the cloud native ecosystem. Mr. Dolezal shared the growing numbers of the CNCF end user members, welcoming, Black Market, Raincoat and Thales.

Joint Meeting of the Governing Board and Technical Oversight Committee (TOC)
The CNCF TOC joined the call at 4:41 PM PT for a joint session of the Governing Board and TOC

TOC Chair Update

Ms. Fox shared that the TOC has actively been listening and addressing concerns expressed by the community. She addressed several KubeCon + CloudNativeCon updates, including that the TAG/TOC meeting discussed revamping of TAG intent and coverage, and that the TOC/ TAG meet 'n greet lunch was a mild success with good connection. The clear need for closer engagement with maintainers as projects and maintainers do not appear to leverage TOC repo content for navigating levels.

Ms. Fox gave an action item to the board, input is being requested and sought for the Cloud Native Definition and CNCF values. She stated the documents attached in the presentation will be requesting approval from the board when proposed final versions are ready.

Ms. Fox shared that the TOC is looking at its values and seeking further input for the proposed updates to those CNCF values. Ms. Fox reiterates the importance of these values, which are integral to the CNCF's charter. She acknowledges the significant changes that have occurred within the CNCF since its inception, suggesting that these developments necessitate a refresh of the organization's core values. Ms. Fox emphasizes the importance of collaborative input by inviting additional comments and suggestions from the rest of the board members. The document containing the proposed values is linked for review, and Ms. Fox stresses that the suggestions are not final and that the board's feedback and ideas are crucial to refining and enhancing the values of the foundation.

It was agreed that one or more optional working sessions would be scheduled in January for Governing Board members to discuss and provide input on the proposed updates to the CNCF values.

Training and Certification Update
Mr. Aniszczyk shared updates from LF training and certification in 2023. He noted that 10 new initiatives launched or expected to be GA by the end of 2023.

He mentioned the 2024 Training and Certification roadmap. Including, 7 new trainings expected to launch, such as, Cilium (Advanced), Crossplane, OpenTelemetry, OpenCost, Istio (Advanced), KEDA and KubeFlow. There will be 4 new certifications, Backstage, Cilium, OpenTelemetry and Kyverno. There are plans for an AI related training, e.g. AI workloads with k8s.

Mr. Seepersad shared that we have a big sale at the end of every year, including Cyber Monday sales. The refactored certification exams went really well.

Mr. Aniszczyk touched on the revenue from LF Training and Certification. Exam volumes have increased towards Asia this year to 56% total. Mr. Seepersad added that with recent tech layoffs it affected people's training and those entering their careers.

Mr. Aniszczyk and Seepersad presented the 2024 Training and Certification revenue goal, with priorities including adding dedicated digital marketing resources to focus on the T&C catalog across all CNCF channels and events as well as continuing the ramp up of Affiliates. Mr. Seepersad encouraged the governing board to introduce us to the key folks hiring technical talent in their organizations and help finding SMEs for new exam development.

Mr. Aniszczyk stated he will send a note to the board around the help needed from the board regarding training and certification recommendations.

Marketing Updates
Ms. Smolensky provided highlights around CNCF marketing, including 240 online programs booked, 30 hosted KCDs, two end-user videos produced - highlighting MBTI and Intuit, six published reports (including the Open Telemetry Project Journey and CNCF GitOps Microsurvey), three new Humans of Cloud Native profiles. Ms. Smolensky also shared recent PR and AR highlights, including 80+ pre- and post event articles from members appearing in the leading technology publications and158 in-person/ virtual press and analyst attendees from US, EMEA and APAC at KubeCon + CloudNativeCon NA.

Ms. Smolensky shared highlights from the first AI Hub at KubeCon NA. The unconference event was a huge success with standing room only as the community gathered for sessions that featured a demo from HugginFace, an overview of k8s KEP on dynamic resource allocation, and topics such as, Slurm on k8s, infrastructure security with AI and more.

Kubecon + CloudNativeCon Updates & CNCF Event Updates
Ms. Heric presented the statistics from KubeCon China, including 1,603K registrants and 61% first time attendees. Ms. Heric shared that the community was very excited to be back together again. She thanked the sponsor and sales team. Ms. Heric presented statistics about KubeCon + CloudNativeCon EU 2023 in Chicago with 13,666 attendees. Ms. Heric thanked Arun, Stephen and Thomas for hosting a successful Kids Day. She thanked all of the sponsors, the event would not run without.

She also reviewed details for KubeCon + CloudNativeCon Europe in Paris and upcoming 2024 Event plans for KubeCons, KubeDays + Project Events. Announcing the new KubeCon India being added in Delhi in December 2024.

Project Updates
Mr. Aniszczyk reviewed recent project highlights, noting that we currently have 177 projects. He reviewed project-level updates and new projects, including 26 sandbox projects in the backlog.

Mr. Aniszczyk reviewed a summary of the Maintainer Survey summary for 2023. Highlighting 82% maintainer satisfaction, 86% of maintainers reporting they are satisfied with CNCF staff response time and 86% would recommend CNCF for other projects. He mentioned key takeaways from the maintainer survey, including that projects are largely satisfied, but could use support with community, security audits, end user collaboration and Events.

Mr. Aniszczyk shared the growing community with mentorships, noting a goal of 150 mentorship projects this year has been surpassed. He noted that this comes from a mix of LFX mentorships, Google Summer of Code and Google Season of Docs. There are big success stories coming from the program and highlighted in Humans of Cloud Native. He asked the board to encourage their maintainers to get involved in mentoring if they can or if they have any candidates for Humans of Cloud Native in their organizations to reach out to CNCF staff.

Governing Board Elections
Ms. O'Connor congratulated the Gold, Silver, and Developer seat winners that closed at 12pm PT earlier today, on December 14th. Winners included, Thomas Di Giacomo, Justin Dustzadeh, and Craig Box.

Ms. O'Connor reviewed the Governing Board Chairperson and GB appointed TOC seat election timelines and logistics. The election winners for chairperson and GB-TOC will be announced at the end of January and early February.

Schedule for 2024
Ms. O'Connor communicated the 2024 Governing Board schedule. The next board meeting will be combined with a strategy session in person at KubeCon in Paris. She noted we plan to kick off Board Town Hall sessions again for 2024. Ms. O'Connor shared CNCF Board meetings for Q2 - Q4 dates will be finalized in the new year.

Special Announcements
Ms. Sharma requested the Governing Board to take the 4Q 2023 CNCF Satisfaction Survey.

Ms. Sharma thanked everyone for their participation.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:26 PM PT.